Advisory Council to the

Nuclear Waste Management Organization

Record of Discussion: January 19, 2004 Meeting

Record of discussion of the meeting of the Advisory Council to the

Nuclear Waste Management Organization (NWMO) / Sociētē de gestion des dēchets nuclēaires (sgdn)

held at Toronto, Ontario, commencing at 1:00 p.m. and concluding at 5:00 p.m. on January 19, 2004.

Present

Advisory Council:

David Crombie Chairman David Cameron Member Helen Cooper Member Gordon Cressy Member Fred Gilbert Member Eva Ligeti Member Derek Lister Member Donald Obonsawin Member Daniel Rozon Member

Also in attendance:

NWMO Board of Directors:

Adèle Malo Ken Nash Fred Long Laurie Comeau

NWMO:

Elizabeth Dowdeswell President

Kathryn Shaver Corporate Secretary

Donna Pawlowski (Items 3-5)

Canadian Policy Research Networks:

Judith Maxwell, President,

CPRN (Item 5)

PART I

JOINT SESSION WITH BOARD OF DIRECTORS

1. Constitution of Meeting

The Chairman called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m.

In his opening remarks, the Chairman welcomed Eva Ligeti to the Advisory Council. The Chairman also welcomed NWMO Board members whom, at the Chairman's invitation, were in attendance for a joint discussion with the Advisory Council on the NWMO's engagement initiatives.

2. President's Update on Workplan

The Chairman invited the NWMO President to provide an overview for the Board and Advisory Council on plans under way to launch key areas of the 2004 Business Plan.

In her presentation, the President reported on a range of activities:

- The NWMO has established an Assessment Team that will lead the work on the assessment of the different management approaches.
 - The team is comprised of NWMO staff and external members who together will bring a cross-section of expertise to the integrated assessment of management approaches.
 - The President reviewed the profiles of the external members of the Team who will be working closely with NWMO staff in completing the assessment of approaches in the first half of 2004.
 - The results of the assessment will be reported in the NWMO's second discussion document, planned for mid-2004.
 - A backgrounder on the Assessment Team workplan and biographies of external Team members were distributed at the meeting.
- A meeting with invited guests on the topic of Social Issues took place on December 16th. This group of individuals, who had been involved in the first phase of the NWMO's work and discussion on social issues, were invited to share their reaction to NWMO's first discussion document, discuss the NWMO's plans for engagement activities in the coming months, and consider the advisability of a social issues workshop.
 - Overall, the group expressed a positive reaction to the discussion document, and a general feeling that the study and document are going in the right direction.
 - The group recognized and respected NWMO's effort to: take a new approach to the waste management problem; create a new frame within which to understand the problem and search for solutions; and reach out and involve a wide diversity of experts to surface issues.
 - There was some difference in view as to whether the presentation of the material in the document is too complex or inaccessible to the average reader; and, whether complementary and simpler material is necessary.

- There was discussion on the extent of public involvement which is necessary for a successful study.
- There was little if any sense that a social issues workshop is needed at this time, given the planned activities of the NWMO.
- The NWMO convened its second meeting of the Ethics Roundtable on January 17th.
 - Participants were invited to comment on the NWMO's first Discussion Document. Overall, there was a very positive reaction to the Document, and to the process which NWMO is engaged in. The Roundtable had suggestions for enhancing clarity on a number of issues.
 - The Roundtable has taken on the task of creating a list of questions directed at both substantive and process ethical issues as a common foundation for discussion and debate and to be of assistance to, and to help hold accountable, the work of the Assessment Team.
- The NWMO held meetings January 14th in Toronto and January 15th in Calgary, to bring together senior corporate environmental and sustainable development executives from a cross-section of Canada's major resource, energy, chemical, waste and recycling industries.
 - The meetings allowed the NWMO to hear the experiences and lessons learned in key corporations that have faced major challenges in the public policy arena involving large and often controversial projects.
 - Much of the NWMO's early thinking was validated in these discussions. Key comments raised included the need to specifically acknowledge the legacy issues and sustainability aspects of managing used nuclear fuel; the need to acknowledge the appropriate level of study at the appropriate time (i.e. an EA is not appropriate at this time); and the need to incorporate approaches to risk management/risk acceptance.
 - The range of questions proposed by the NWMO for the assessment of management approaches was considered to be inclusive and comprehensive. Participants noted that the institutional and governance dimensions were absolutely fundamental.
 - They noted further that risk and security aspects may become increasingly important.
 - Finally, they noted that the NWMO will need to consider scientific uncertainty, particularly as it pertains to predictions and their validation.
- A listing of recently commissioned background papers was distributed at the meeting. The papers will be available on the NWMO website once completed. The President distributed two papers that she thought would be of interest to both the Board and Advisory Council:
 - Overview of European Initiatives: Towards a Framework to Incorporate Citizen Values and Social Considerations in Decision-making by Kjell Andersson, Karita Research
 - A Comparative Overview of Approaches to Management of Spent Nuclear Fuel and High Level Wastes in Different Countries by Charles McCombie & Bengt Tveiten.

- The President reported that the NWMO was in the process of appointing members to an International Panel. The Panel would be comprised of internationally accomplished experts in different fields, who would agree to review and comment on the NWMO's milestone documents at key points in the study process.
- The President referenced other NWMO meetings that had taken place since the last monthly report to the Council and Board.
 - As part of this update, the President noted the NWMO's quarterly update meeting with Natural Resources Canada, convened on January 16, 2004.
 - The President reported on a November meeting with the Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade. The NWMO emphasized its desire to fully understand the scope of international conventions and treaties to which Canada is a signatory, so that the study will reflect the international standards and principles that may be relevant for the safe, secure management of used fuel. Being able to demonstrate robust provisions for security, physical protection and regulatory oversight will be a key part of the NWMO's study.

The President noted other near-term activities:

- She reported that the NWMO would be meeting with some members of Nuclear Waste Watch in March 2004.
- The President reported that Natural Resources Canada was proceeding to schedule a date for a meeting of their Minister and the NWMO President.
- The NWMO is working on the drafting of the 2003 NWMO Annual Report, for submission to the Minister of Natural Resources by the end of March.

Discussion ensued amongst Advisory Council and Board members, as the President invited questions and comments on the workplan.

3. Discussion Document 1 – Debrief on Reaction to Date

The President tabled a briefing note that summarizes the range of initial reaction to the discussion document in the first six weeks since its late November release. She reviewed the nature of comments received through: public submissions posted on the NWMO website; correspondence to the NWMO; media commentary; focus group reviews of the document; and comments provided in the course of other meetings convened by the NWMO.

As feedback on the document is received by the NWMO, those comments will be communicated to the Assessment Team, to ensure that they are aware of issues and questions being raised by Canadians and taken into consideration in their analysis. The NWMO website provides a forum for public comments to be submitted and shared publicly. Comments on the discussion document will be welcomed through the study period.

4. Engagement with Aboriginal Peoples

The Chairman invited Donna Pawlowski (NWMO) to deliver a presentation on the NWMO's outreach with aboriginal peoples. She reviewed the key components of outreach with aboriginal organizations proposed by the NWMO for 2004. Ms. Pawlowski reported that, as part of this outreach, the NWMO had made contact with national aboriginal organizations and hoped to establish relationships with each of the five national aboriginal organizations and to work collaboratively on consultations relating to the NWMO's work.

The President invited Advisory Council and Board discussion on the proposed directions. Through the discussion period, Council and Board members inquired and commented on:

- The anticipated timing of these activities.
- The importance of ensuring quality processes that will be accepted by aboriginal peoples.
- The need to ensure NWMO's engagement plans will meet the expectations of Natural Resources Canada under the *Nuclear Fuel Waste Act* in relation to consultations with aboriginal peoples.
- The necessity for the engagement processes to enable the NWMO to invite and collect feedback from these organizations on the management approaches.
- The need to ensure that the NWMO understands issues and priorities for aboriginal peoples in different regions.
- Next steps in considering how traditional knowledge might contribute to the NWMO's study, and the importance of moving beyond the conceptual underpinnings of traditional knowledge to examine practical applications for the NWMO study.
- The status of communication plans with aboriginal organizations.

The President noted that the NWMO's business plan for 2004 provides the flexibility to adopt additional models of engagement as may be appropriate later in the year.

5. Dialogues in Nuclear Site Communities

The President introduced the NWMO's work under way for dialogues with representatives from communities that presently host nuclear facilities. Ms. Pawlowski outlined the highlights of this work. Noting that the communities which currently store nuclear fuel waste have special experience, insights and perspectives which should be drawn upon to help inform the work of the NWMO, she summarized the initiatives undertaken to date and the types of activities planned for 2004.

Discussion ensued, as Advisory Council and Board members asked about the details of the proposed dialogues, including the proposed scope of participation and identification of nuclear host communities and the intended role of the community dialogues.

6. National Citizens' Dialogues

The Chairman welcomed a guest speaker, Judith Maxwell, President, Canadian Policy Research Networks. Ms. Maxwell provided a presentation on the approach and focus of the National Citizens' Dialogues that CPRN is convening in partnership with the NWMO in 2004.

- The NWMO has entered into a MOU with the Canadian Policy Research Networks (CPRN) to hold a National Citizens' Dialogue on the long-term management of used nuclear fuel. The goal of the dialogue is to provide NWMO with an understanding of how ordinary, unaffiliated Canadian citizens approach, assess and make tradeoffs around the complex issues related to long-term management of used nuclear fuel. In so doing CPRN will seek to identify the values framework that citizens use when considering this matter.
- She outlined the detailed scope of the project and the methodology proposed in conducting these dialogues with Canadians. The sessions are designed to allow for baseline information to be shared with participants and to encourage participants to listen, learn and have a dialogue on the issues, rather than a debate.
- o She reported that the NWMO's field work begins in late January.
- Advisory Council and Board members received copies of the workbook developed by CPRN for the dialogues, which draws from the issues in the NWMO discussion document.

The Advisory Council and Board members engaged in discussion with Ms. Maxwell. They inquired about the details of participant selection, and the nature of the reports generated out of the dialogues.

The President reiterated her invitation to the Advisory Council and Board members to attend one of the dialogue sessions, so that they might hear directly some views and perspectives of citizens in different regions of the country. She observed that many members had already registered to observe a national dialogue, and that additional openings were still available. Copies of observer guidelines were distributed to those registered for dialogue sessions. The President welcomed feedback from the Council and Board members on the sessions that they attend.

The joint session of the Advisory Council and Board of Directors terminated at 4 P.M. Board members withdrew from the meeting.

PART II

ADVISORY COUNCIL BUSINESS

7. Approval of Agenda

The Advisory Council Chairman called the second part of the meeting to order at 4 p.m. for purposes of addressing Advisory Council business.

The Council approved the agenda for this part of the meeting.

8. Minutes of Previous Meeting

Minutes from the September 23rd, 2003 Council meeting were brought forward for approval.

On motion duly made, seconded and unanimously carried, the minutes of the Advisory Council meeting held on September 23rd, 2003, were approved.

9. 2004 Meeting Schedule

The Chairman led Council discussion on the schedule of upcoming Council meetings.

- He reported that Nuclear Waste Watch had requested a meeting with the Advisory Council. Noting the broad membership of this organization, and the membership's consideration of nuclear issues over the years, the Advisory Council expressed interest in the opportunity to hear the perspectives of representatives of Nuclear Waste Watch. The Council Chairman and President undertook to contact Nuclear Waste Watch to pursue the scheduling of the meeting. (*)
- The Chairman invited Advisory Council comment on their desired involvement in the Annual Report of the NWMO.
 - Given the independence of the Advisory Council, members did not wish to provide their comments in the organization's annual report.
 - The Council intends to write their own letter with reflections on 2003 to the Minister of Natural Resources Canada, for transmittal in late March.
 (*)
 - It was agreed that the President would provide a factual account of Advisory Council meetings and operations in the NWMO Annual Report.
- The Chairman invited Council discussion on a proposed schedule of meetings, as outlined in a draft schedule distributed at the meeting. Following discussion, the Council agreed on the following dates for meetings:
 - o February 4, 2004 conference call
 - o March 23, 2004
 - o May 20, 2004

Termination of Meeting

The Chairman declared the meeting terminated at 5:00 p.m.

(* denotes action required)

Dated the 23rd day of March 2004

Dated the 23rd day of March, 2004 Corporate Secretary